

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Compilations of Works by Different Persons, Families, or Corporate Bodies (New 6.2.2.11)

ALA thanks LC for this proposal to clarify the Chapter 6 instructions relating to compilations of works by different persons, families, or corporate bodies. We generally support the proposal, although we have various questions and suggested revisions, as detailed below.

Change 1, 6.2.2.8, Recording the Preferred Title for a Work

ALA agrees with the proposed rewording.

Change 2, 6.2.2.11, Recording the Preferred Title for a Compilation of Works by Different Persons, Families, or Corporate Bodies

ALA supports the new instruction, with the following proposed revisions:

1. We prefer the use of the term “commonly identified” instead of “known” (see 6JSC/Chair/15/rev/2/ALA response). If the JSC agrees, this substitution would need to be made in both 6.2.2.11.1 and 6.2.2.11.2.
2. We suggest removing one occurrence of the phrase “for the compilation” in 6.2.2.11.1:

6.2.2.11.1 Collective Title

If a compilation of works by different persons, families, or corporate bodies is known by a collective title in resources embodying the compilation or in reference sources, apply the instructions at 6.2.2.4–6.2.2.5 in choosing the preferred title ~~for the compilation~~. Record the collective title as the preferred title of the compilation.

3. We recommend clarifying the wording in the proposed first paragraph of 6.2.2.11.2, by adding a phrase used in 6.14.2.8.6, *Incomplete Compilations*, and incorporating a reference to 6.2.2.4-6.2.2.5.

6.2.2.11.2 No Collective Title

If a compilation of works by different persons, families, or corporate bodies is not known by a collective title in resources embodying the compilation or in reference sources, record the preferred title for each of the individual works separately by applying the instructions at 6.2.2.4–6.2.2.5.

4. We recommend revising the first sentence of the Alternative to 6.2.2.11.2, so that the instruction is to record a devised title:

Alternative

Record a devised ~~Devise a brief descriptive~~ title (see 2.3.2.11) for the compilation.

Apply this instruction instead of or in addition to recording the preferred title for each of the individual works.

Additional questions:

- Should 6.2.2.10 also be restructured along similar lines to more clearly identify instructions for compilations with and without collective titles?
- We agree with the use of “by” in this instruction name. Should a similar change be made to the title of 6.2.2.10: *Recording the Preferred Title for a Compilation of Works ~~of~~ by One Person, Family, or Corporate Body*?
- Would it be beneficial to further separate the collective title instructions here to address distinctive and non-distinctive titles? For example, see the following in Hathi Trust: <http://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=coo.31924095654160;view=1up;seq=5>, a collection entitled “Essays” by three different authors.

Change 3, 6.27.1.4, Compilations of Works by Different Persons, Families, or Corporate Bodies – Alternative

ALA agrees with the revisions, although we recommend further clarification of the reference instruction in the alternative, from “see 6.2.2.11.2” to “see 6.2.2.11.2 alternative”. A similar reference to an alternative instruction appears in the Alternative to 6.27.2.3.

Change 4, 6.27.4.4, Variant Access Point Representing a Compilation of Works By Different Persons, Families, or Corporate Bodies

ALA supports renaming this instruction.

Additional question:

- After renaming this instruction, it will become obvious that RDA lacks similar instructions for constructing variant access points for a compilation of works by different persons, families, or corporate bodies. Should RDA be expanded to address this situation?

Change 5, Glossary definition of collective title

While ALA agrees that the definition should be revised, we would prefer a greater similarity in structure between the two definitions. Our proposed revisions below offer the following changes:

- Overall: We propose beginning the definition with the type of collective title (title proper or preferred title) and using the term “inclusive” in both definitions.
- First definition: We have suggested using the phrase “embodying two or more works”; similar language appears in RDA 2.1.2.2. We have also moved the final explanatory sentence to this definition.

- Second definition: We believe that preferred collective titles are not limited to compilations of works by different authors, thus our revision has omitted this clause. We have proposed a parallel sentence about how preferred collective titles are determined. However, we are not convinced that this is necessary. Finally, we recommend adding a reference to Conventional Collective Title here.

Marked-up copy (based on the LC proposal)

Collective Title

- 1) A title proper used as ~~that is~~ an inclusive title for a resource embodying two or more works. A collective title proper may be supplied by the publisher, etc., or devised by a cataloguer. ~~containing several separately titled component parts.~~
- 2) A preferred title used as an ~~preferred~~ inclusive title for a compilation of two or more works ~~by different persons, families, or corporate bodies.~~ A preferred collective title may be chosen from resources embodying the compilation or from reference sources, or may be devised by a cataloguer.

Conventional Collective Title▼

~~A collective title may be supplied by the publisher, etc., or devised by a cataloguer.~~

Clean copy

Collective Title

- 1) A title proper used as an inclusive title for a resource embodying two or more works. A collective title proper may be supplied by the publisher, etc., or devised by a cataloguer.
- 2) A preferred title used as an inclusive title for a compilation of two or more works. A preferred collective title may be chosen from resources embodying the compilation or from reference sources, or may be devised by a cataloguer.

Conventional Collective Title▼

Note: For a full clean copy of 6.2.2 which contains all of the ALA recommendations from our responses to 6JSC/Chair/15, 6JSC/LC/29, and 6JSC/LC/30, see Appendix B in 6JSC/LC/30/ALA response.